## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF NEW MEXICO

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

v.

STATE OF NEW MEXICO, *ex rel.*, State Engineer, A & R Productions, *et al.* 

Defendants.

## 02 JUN - 5 AH IO: 12 01CV00072 BDB/WWD(ACE) ZUNI RIVER STREAM SYSTEM (1610 ACE - 1001E

UNITED STATES' OBJECTION TO THE SPECIAL MASTER'S REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION ON ZUNI RIVER BASIN ADJUDICATION PROCEDURE

On April 29, 2002, the United States was served with the Special Master's Report and Recommendations on the Zuni River Basin Adjudication Procedure, dated and filed April 26, 2002. By Order of this Court, dated and filed on May 10, 2002, the time for parties to object to the recommendations of the Special Master was extended to June 5, 2002. For the following reason, the United States objects to the Special Master's recommendation that all defendants be dismissed:

The report recommends, <u>inter alia</u>, that "the United States ... move to dismiss all defendants without prejudice (naming 'unknown claimants to the surface and underground waters of the Zuni River Basin' instead) ... [and that] ... the Court order the United States to conduct the hydrographic survey of the entire Zuni River basin, bear the costs of the survey and the fees of the Special Master and necessary staff during the hydrographic survey phase." See Report of Special Master, pp. 10-11.

The United States will fund and conduct the hydrographic survey of the basin,  $\frac{1}{2}$  as well as continue to pay the fees of the Special Master and necessary staff incurred during the course of the survey.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>underline{y}}$  The commitment to fund the hydrographic survey is, of course, contingent upon Congress's continued appropriation of sufficient funds to the Department of the Interior.

However, the United States interprets the Special Master's report as recommending that all defendants be dismissed from the suit prior to the completion of the hydrographic survey. If that interpretation is accurate, the United States respectfully objects.

Hydrographic surveys require field inspections where the uses and sources of water by all claimants/water users are noted, irrigated tracts are delineated, diversion structures, and canals, drainage ditched and other conveyance facilities are identified. There will be many instances where the source and specific use of water, as well as the conveyance facilities, can not identified and determined from aerial photography and will require access to the land(s) of claimant/water user. If access is refused, the United States can petition this Court for relief under Rule 34, Fed. R. Civ. P. (Entry Upon Land for Inspection and Other Purposes) because the claimant/water user is a defendant in the suit. On the other hand, if claimant/water user has been dismissed and is not a defendant, this Court is without the jurisdiction to order entry. Without recourse to this Court, completion of the survey is unnecessarily delayed and, most likely will prove more costly.

The defendants to this action were identified through the use of the best available data and records.<sup>2</sup> Although there may be parties that have been improperly joined, it is the opinion of the United States that the majority of those identified and joined are proper parties to this suit. As to those parties, this Court has the necessary jurisdiction to address the problems that may arise in the completion of the hydrographic survey. The United States shares the Special Master's concern that there may be parties improperly joined. However, no party improperly joined will be prejudiced by remaining a party since the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>/<sub>4</sub> Realty tax records of Cibola and McKinley Counties.

Special Master recommends that this Court's stay be retained. Therefore, parties improperly joined will not incur litigation expenses if they choose not to actively participate and, of course, will be dismissed during the course of the survey or at its completion. Another option available is to permit improperly joined parties to file with the Court a disclaimer of interest(s) to the use of the surface and/or ground water for the Zuni River basin.<sup>3/</sup> The United States would dismiss all those filing a disclaimer of interest(s).

Respectfully submitted this  $\underline{\mathcal{Z}}$ day of June, 2002.

) (onull

Charles E. O'Connell, Jr. Attorney for Plaintiff the United States

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{3}{2}$  Disclaimers would be proper after the geographic scope of the case area is identified. See Report of Special Master, pp. 9-10.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the  $\underline{S}^{\mu}$  day of June, 2002, a true and correct copy of the foregoing

was served by United States Postal Service first class, postage pre-paid mail to the following:

Charnas, Stephen, Esq. Sutin, Thayer & Browne PC P.O. Box 1945 6565 Americas Pkwy., N.E. Albuquerque, NM 87103-1945

Drennan, Jocelyn Esq. Rodey, Dickason, Sloan & Robb P.O. Box 1888 Albuquerque, NM 87103

Ionta, Robert W., Esq. McKim, Head & Ionta P.O. Box 1059 Gallup, NM 87305

Shadle, Stephen P., Esq. Westover, Shadle, Carter & Walsma, PLC 2260 S. Fourth Ave., #2000 Yuma, AZ 85364

Stripp, William G., Esq. P.O. Box 159 Ramah, NM 87321

Carroll, Ernest L., Esq. Losee, Carson, Haas & Carroll, P.A. Box 1720 Artesia, NM 87103

Dahl, Jeffrey A., Esq. Lamb, Metzgar, Lines & Dahl, PA P.O. Box 987 Albuquerque, NM 87103 Gardner, David R., Esq. P.O. Box 62 Bernalillo, NM 87004

Joca, Mary Ann, Esq. U.S. Dept. of Agriculture 517 Gold Ave., S.W. Rm. 4017 Albuquerque, NM 87102

Marx, Jane, Esq. Williams & Works, P.A. 4417 Corrales Rd. Corrales, New Mexico 87048

Pollack, Stanley M., Esq. Navajo Nation Dept. of Justice P.O. Box 2010 Window Rock, AZ 86515-2010

Smith, Mark A., Esq. Rodey, Dickason, Sloan Akin & Robb P.O. Box 1888 Albuquerque, NM 87103

Williams, Pamela, Esq. Division of Indian Affairs Office of the Solicitor 1849 C St., N.W., Rm 6456 Washington, DC 20240

Drullinger, Sandra S., Pro Se 818 E. Maple St. Hoopeston, IL 60942 Gugliotta, Kimberly J., Pro Se 158 W. William Casey St. Corona, AZ 85641

۰.

Lebeck, David R., Pro Se P.O. Drawer 38 Gallup, NM 87305

McBride, Gerlad F., Pro Se 2725 Aliso Dr., N.E. Albuquerque, NM 87110

Bunch, Steven L., Esq.N. M. Highway & Trans. Dept.P.O. Box 1149Santa Fe, NM 87504-1149

Cassutt, Kenneth J., Esq. 530-B Harkle Road Santa Fe, NM 87505

Davidson, Tessa T., Esq. Swaim, Schrandt & Davidson 4830 Juan Tabo, N.E., Suite F Albuquerque, NM 87111

Frederick, R. Bruce, Esq. Stephen G. Hughes, Esq. N.M. State Land Office P.O. Box 1148 Sante Fe, NM 87504-1148

Gehlert, David W., Esq. USDOJ-ENRD 999 18<sup>TH</sup> St., Suite 945 Denver, Colorado 80202

Carroll, Ernest L., Esq. Losee, Carson, Haas & Carroll P.O. Box 1720 Artesia, NM 88211 Shoenfeld, Peter B., Esq. P.O. Box 2421 Sante Fe, NM 87504-2421

Nixon, Sunny J., Esq. Rodey, Dickason, Sloan, Akin, & Robb, P.A. P.O. Box 1357 Santa Fe NM 87504-1357

Sanchez, Dorothy C., Esq. 715 Tijeras N.W. Albuquerque, NM 87102

Barnhouse, Randolph H., Esq Rosebrough & Barnhouse P.O. Box 1744 Gallup, NM 87305-174

Bushnell, Darcy S., Esq. U.S. District Court 333 Lomas Blvd., N.W. Albuquerque, NM 87102-2272

Gabin, Special Master Vickie L. U.S. District Court P.O. Box 2384 Sante Fe, NM 87504-2384

Boynton, Bruce, Esq. P.O. Box 1239 Grants, NM 87020

Fahmy, Peter, Esq. Office of Regional Solicitor 755 Parfet St., Suite 151 Lakewood, CO 80215

DePauli, Louis E., Pro Se 1610 Redrock Drive Gallup, NM 87031 Lebeck, Albert O., Pro Se P.O. Box 38 Gallup, NM 87305

McBride, Myrrl W., Pro Se 2725 Aliso Drive, N.E. Albuquerque, NM 87110

Beardsley, Ann Hambleton, Pro Se HC 61, Box 747 Ramah, NM 87321

Brodrick. Ted, Pro Se P.O. Box 219 Ramah, NM 87321

Saunders, D.L., Esq. Bagley, Ted, Esq. Office of State Engineer P.O. Box 25102 Sante Fe, NM 87504-5102

Peter B. Shoenfeld, P.A. P.O. Box 2421 Santa Fe, NM 87504-2421 Shaw, Mark H., Esq. 3733 Eubank Blvd., N.E. Albuquerque, NM 87111

Weldon, John B., Esq. Lewis, M. Byron, Esq. McGinnis, Mark A., Esq 2850 East Camelback Road, Suite 200 Phoenix, AZ 85016

Nelson, Stephen R., Esq. P.O. Box 1276 Albuquerque, NM 87103-1276

Beall, Larry D., Esq.6715 Academy Road, N.E.Albuquerque, NM 87109

David Candelaria, Pro Se 12,000 Ice Caves Rd. Grants, NM 87020

Clara M. Mercer 1017 S. 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue Yuma, AZ 85364

hurde